

appendix 2

Outcomes of Consultation: Submissions  
from Interested Persons

Contents

Introduction to Appendix 2	1
Quotations, abbreviations and macrons	1
List of Interested Persons	3
 1. Methodology of analysis, report content and themes	 13
Background	14
Purpose of the IP report	14
Organisations granted Interested Person status	14
Submission format	15
Methodology	15
Project team	15
Methodological approach	16
Registration of submissions	16
Data analysis methods	16
Format and language in the IP report	20
Outline of the IP report	20
IP report content	21
IP report themes	22
 2. Submitter profiles	 24
Submitter type	25
Attitude towards genetic modification	26
Stance of Interested Persons on differing uses of genetic modification	26
 3. Analysis of submissions from Interested Persons	 28
3.1 Strategy: an introduction	29
3.2 Strategic options	31
Introduction	31

Continuum of attitude toward genetic modification	32
Strategic options to achieve industry goals	33
Competitiveness and innovation	33
Research and development and the knowledge-based economy	34
“GM-free” nation	35
Strategic options to reduce risk	36
Prohibiting the use of genetic modification technology	36
Extending existing moratorium/delaying decision on use of genetic modification	37
Undertaking formal assessment of risk	38
<b>3.3 Strategic issues</b>	<b>40</b>
Introduction	40
Key themes	40
Acceptability	42
Cultural acceptability	44
Environmental acceptability	44
Choice	45
Choice and food	45
Choice and organics	45
Choice and medical care	47
Risk management	47
Opportunities	48
<b>3.4 Strategic outcomes</b>	<b>49</b>
Introduction	49
Health	49
Health outcomes from use	49
Health outcomes from avoidance	51
Environment	52
Environmental outcomes from use	52
Environmental outcomes from avoidance	53
Production	55
Production outcomes from use	55
Production outcomes from avoidance	57
Research	60
Research outcomes from use	60
Research outcomes from avoidance	61
Culture and ethics	61
Cultural and ethical outcomes from use	61
Cultural and ethical outcomes from avoidance	63
<b>3.5 Statutory and regulatory processes</b>	<b>65</b>
Introduction	65
Context	65
How submitters responded to the Warrant items	68

Profile of submitters	68
Key themes	69
Adequacy of statutory and regulatory processes	70
Views on the current framework	70
Profiling the views on adequacy	71
Strengths and weaknesses of the statutory and regulatory system	72
Changes sought by submitters to the current statutory and regulatory system	74
Nature of changes sought	74
Changes sought to HSNO legislation and regulatory processes	75
Key issues raised by submitters in relation to statutory and regulatory changes	77
International consistency	78
Features of a good regulatory framework	80
Interrelationship between the HSNO Act and other legislation	81
HSNO principles, concepts and definitions	83
Other proposed changes to HSNO Act	84
Decision-making	87
Compliance and monitoring	91
Risk assessment	92
Discretionary powers	95
Regulation of low-risk, contained experiments	95
Regulation of genetically modified food	100
Maori views	102
Role of ERMA	104
Policy framework	107
New organisational or institutional mechanisms	109
<b>3.6 Where, how, and for what purpose ...</b>	<b>113</b>
Introduction	113
Types of response to ‘where’, ‘how’, and ‘for what purpose’	114
Where genetic modification is used	114
How genetic modification is used	115
Purpose of genetic modification	115
Uses of genetic modification technology in New Zealand	116
Specific examples of use of genetic modification technology	117
Government funding and approval agencies	118
Land-based production uses of genetic modification	120
Environment-focused use of genetic modification	121
Human health-related use of genetic modification	122
Food-related use of genetic modification	123
Extent of information on use of genetic modification	125

<b>3.7</b>	<b>Evidence and uncertainty</b>	<b>127</b>
	Introduction	127
	Submitter profile	127
	Content of the submissions	128
	Key themes	128
	Public perception	128
	Causes of public uncertainty	128
	Acceptable and unacceptable uses	130
	Research into public attitudes	131
	Changing public perception	132
	Risks and safety	132
	Risk management	133
	Uncertainty about impacts	139
	Environmental impacts	139
	Health impacts	140
	Commercial and economic impacts	141
	Research and education impacts	142
	Social impacts	143
	Concluding observations	143
<b>3.8</b>	<b>Risks and benefits</b>	<b>146</b>
	Introduction	146
	Submitter profile	146
	Content of the submissions	146
	Key themes	147
	Risks and safety	147
	Risks of the use of genetic technology	148
	Safety of the technology	148
	Assessing the risk	150
	Benefits and costs	151
	Benefits of use	151
	Costs of use	153
	Benefits of avoidance	155
	Costs of avoidance	156
	Advantaged and disadvantaged groups	157
	Concluding observations	158
<b>3.9</b>	<b>International obligations and implications</b>	<b>159</b>
	Introduction	159
	Key themes	160
	Applicable international obligations	161
	United Nations instruments and organisations	161
	World Trade Organization agreements	162
	Trans-Tasman agreements	163
	Other multilateral organisations and agreements	163
	Sovereignty and autonomy	163

Opportunities and benefits of international agreements and cooperation	164
Compliance and compatibility with trading partners	165
Economic, trade and commercial considerations	166
Cultural implications	166
Maori views	166
Other views	167
Ethical considerations of international obligations	168
Environmental protection	169
New Zealand's international reputation and relations	170
<b>3.10 Liability issues</b>	<b>173</b>
Introduction	173
Establishment of liability	174
Nature of the effects of genetic modification	174
Differing approaches to liability	175
Government responsibility	175
Government liability if genetic modification is not allowed	176
"Polluter-pays" approach to liability	176
Liability of beneficiaries	177
European decision on liability	177
Types of liability	178
Sources of liability	178
Categories of liability	179
Practical examples	179
Regulatory framework for liability	181
Necessity for specific liability provisions	181
Existing regulatory framework for liability	181
Adequacy of existing regulatory framework	182
Inadequacy of existing regulatory framework	183
Recommended changes to liability regulation	184
Liability insurance	184
Availability of liability insurance	184
New Zealand's position on liability insurance	185
International approaches to liability insurance	185
<b>3.11 Intellectual property issues</b>	<b>186</b>
Introduction	186
Key themes	187
Capture of innovation and development	187
Patents have a time limit	187
Disclosure of information	187
What can be patented?	188
Issues of public interest	188
Patenting of human genetic material	188
Moral aspects of patenting	189
Ethics versus economics	190

Indigenous issues	190
Patentability of indigenous flora and fauna	190
WAI 262 claim	191
Western views and indigenous views on property ownership	193
International approaches	194
Economic issues	194
Investment costs and returns	194
Cost to access intellectual property	195
Current trends in intellectual property	195
The ‘race’ for intellectual property	196
The ‘use it or lose it’ trend	196
Access to global intellectual property	197
Ownership issues	198
Future opportunities for New Zealand	198
Intellectual property opportunities in the productive sector	198
Opportunities to trade intellectual property	199
Regulation of intellectual property	200
International agreements	200
Current framework is adequate	200
Current framework is inadequate	201
Future approaches to intellectual property	203
<b>3.12 Responsibilities under the Treaty of Waitangi</b>	<b>204</b>
Introduction	204
Key themes	204
Maori terms	205
Submissions from Maori organisations	205
Role of the Treaty of Waitangi	205
The Crown’s duties under the Treaty	206
Tikanga principles and genetic modification	207
Protection of traditional knowledge	209
Economic benefits	209
Submissions from other Interested Persons	210
Role of the Treaty of Waitangi	210
The Crown’s duties under the Treaty	211
Tikanga principles	213
Participation in economic benefits	214
Health benefits	215
<b>3.13 Global developments and issues</b>	<b>216</b>
Introduction	216
Global environmental issues	217
Global food production solutions offered by genetic modification	217
Negative environmental effects of genetic modification	219
Globalisation of resources	219

Global competition	220
The “biotechnology revolution”	220
Comparative technological advantage	221
Competitive opportunities from avoiding genetic modification	222
Consumer responses to genetic modification	222
Consumer concern about genetic modification, especially food products	222
Consumer demand for “safe” products	223
Consumer price and quality preferences	224
Globalisation of indigenous issues	225
Global legal obligations	225
Restrictiveness of New Zealand’s regulatory regime	225
High compliance costs	226
National strategies for technological development	226
National biotechnology strategies	227
National public education strategies	227
<b>3.14 Opportunities from use or avoidance</b>	<b>228</b>
Introduction	228
Issues raised by submitters: a summary	229
‘Use pathway’ opportunities	230
Human health benefits	230
General economic benefits	230
Increased productivity	232
Increased range of products	232
Environmental benefits	233
Increased profitability	233
Maintain or increase research capability	234
New knowledge-based enterprises	235
Increased competitiveness	235
Enhanced animal welfare	236
New global role	236
‘Avoidance pathway’ opportunities	236
Competitive advantage from organic production	236
New Zealand as “GM free”	237
Environmental benefits	237
Human health benefits	238
General economic benefits	238
New global role	238
‘Dual pathway’ possibilities	238
‘Pathway’ for organic production systems	239
Compatibility of genetic modification and organic production systems	239
Incompatibility of genetic modification and “GM-free” production	240

	Uncertainty about coexistence of genetic modification and organic production systems	240
3.15	<b>Areas of public interest: an introduction</b>	241
	Information, acceptability and choice	242
	Need for public education on issues	242
	The public's right to know	243
	The public's right to choose	244
	The public's exercise of choice	244
3.16	<b>Areas of public interest: human health issues</b>	245
	Introduction	245
	Biomedical research	245
	Food safety	247
	Consumer choice	248
	Labelling of foods	249
3.17	<b>Areas of public interest: environmental matters</b>	251
	Introduction	251
	Effects on the ecosystem	252
	Gene transfer	253
	Management of risks	255
	Environmental benefits	256
3.18	<b>Areas of public interest: economic matters</b>	257
	Introduction	257
	Economic advantage from use of genetic modification	258
	Business development	258
	Research and innovation	259
	Economic advantage from avoidance of genetic modification	260
	Negative impact on "clean green" image	260
	Positive impacts of "GE-free" production, especially organics	261
	Moral constraints on pursuit of economic advantage	261
3.19	<b>Areas of public interest: cultural and ethical concerns</b>	262
	Introduction	262
	Nature of concerns	263
	Key themes	263
	Significance of issues	263
	Cultural concerns	264
	Maori cultural concerns	265
	Other cultural concerns	266
	Ethical concerns	266
	Underlying concepts	267
	Governing principles	268
	Institutional frameworks for ethics	268



Spiritual issues	270
Respect for creation	270
Beliefs of indigenous peoples	271
4.    Glossaries	272
4.1    Glossary of technical terms	273
4.2    Glossary of Maori terms	291
4.3    Abbreviations	292
Index	294